

# Lake Encroachment Individual Permit

Under 29 V.S.A. § 401 *et seq.*



VERMONT DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL CONSERVATION  
**WATERSHED**  
MANAGEMENT DIVISION  
LAKES & PONDS PROGRAM

**Permittee:** Mullen Lakeshore, Inc. c/o Ed Deuso

**Waterbody:** Lake Carmi

**Permit Number:** 2139-LEP

**Project Description:** Shoreline Stabilization

**Project SPAN:** 243-075-10661

**Project Location:** 227 Westcott Rd., Franklin

Based upon the findings contained in this permit, it is the decision of the Department of Environmental Conservation (the Department) that the project described herein, as set forth in the following findings and in the application on file with the Department, complies with the criteria of 29 V.S.A. § 405 and is consistent with the public trust doctrine, and is hereby approved under the following conditions and specifications.

## **a. Specific Conditions**

1. The project shall be carried out in accordance with the final application received by the Department on July 12, 2016 and in accordance with the additional information received from the applicant on September 19, 2016 (the Approved Application); and the conditions and specifications of this permit.
2. Non-structural shoreline stabilization projects completed with unbound stone shall be constructed in accordance with the Approved Application, the additional permit terms and conditions contained herein, and the following special conditions:
  - A. The shoreline stabilization project shall not reclaim lost land through placement of new fill beyond the location of the existing shoreline or create new land lakeward of the existing shoreline, and shall not convert existing sloped shorelines to a vertical plane, unless explicitly specified in the Approved Application.
  - B. Existing water depths in front of the new shoreline stabilization project shall be maintained.
  - C. Reference measurements shall be made and demarcated as necessary in the field using temporary grade stakes and/or lines, or another equivalent method, by the permittee prior to project implementation/construction, to ensure project compliance with permit conditions (a)(2)(A) and (a)(2)(B) above.
  - D. The permittee shall install a turbidity curtain or Department approved equivalent barrier, in the lake around the project work area. The barrier shall extend above the lake's surface and be secured to the bottom of the lake to contain turbidity during the project. If turbidity is observed beyond the work area, work shall be stopped immediately and shall not recommence until the source of the turbidity is identified and corrected. The barrier shall not be installed in a way that blocks navigation in a channel, if applicable. The barrier shall remain in place and be maintained until the project is complete and observations indicate turbidity within the barrier has decreased to the level of turbidity outside the barrier.
  - E. The rocks and/or boulders used for completing the project shall not exceed 3' in diameter in any dimension.

## **b. Standard Conditions**

1. Completion of construction. The project authorized by this permit must be completed within 5 years of the effective date of this permit.

2. Initiation of construction. Initiation of the project authorized by this permit is restricted until after July 1 of any calendar year unless explicitly approved in writing by the Department, and/or specified in the Approved Application.
3. Permit modification. All permit modifications, shall be treated as a new permit application.
4. Nuisance species spread prevention. Prior to placing any equipment (e.g., boat, trailer, vehicle, or gear) that has been in or on any other waterbody into public waters for project implementation/construction, the permittee shall decontaminate the equipment in compliance with the [Voluntary Guidelines to Prevent the Spread of Aquatic Invasive Species through Recreational Activities, Aquatic Nuisance Species Task Force, November 2013](#).
5. Erosion prevention and sediment control. Erosion prevention and sediment control best management practices shall be utilized and maintained to prevent erosion and control sediment to minimize and prevent adverse impacts to water quality during construction of the authorized project. In addition, the permittee shall comply with the following conditions:
  - A. Areas disturbed by the construction activities shall be protected from erosion through the application of seed and mulch upon completion of construction, and shall be temporarily mulched during construction in advance of precipitation events.
  - B. Work shall stop immediately if visible turbidity occurs in the lake as a result of construction activity and shall not recommence until the source of the turbidity is identified and corrected.
6. Heavy equipment operation. Heavy equipment shall work from shore, and shall not work lakeward of mean water level unless explicitly approved in writing by the Department, and/or specified in the Approved Application.
7. Spill prevention. Fuel and lubricants from equipment shall not be discharged into the water. Any spills shall be managed in accordance with all applicable local, state, and federal regulations.
8. Waste management. Any pieces of concrete, stone, construction debris, or other waste materials deposited into the lake during project implementation/construction shall be removed from the lake and disposed of properly, in accordance with all applicable local, state, and federal regulations.
9. Compliance with other regulations. This permit does not relieve the permittee from obtaining all other approvals and permits prior to commencement of activity or from the responsibility to comply with any other applicable federal, state, and local laws or regulations, including but not limited to the Vermont Solid Waste Management Rules, the Vermont Wetland Rules, and the Vermont Shoreland Protection Act.
10. Transfer of permit. Prior to transferring ownership over the encroachment authorized by this permit or the portion of property associated with the encroachment authorized by this permit, the permittee shall give the Department notice of the transfer. The notice shall include the name and contact information for the current permittee and prospective permittee, the proposed date of permit transfer, and a statement signed by the prospective permittee stating that he/she has read and is familiar with this permit and agrees to comply with and be bound by its terms and conditions.
11. Access to property. The permittee shall allow the Commissioner of the Department, or a duly authorized representative, at reasonable times and upon presentation of credentials, to enter upon permittee's property, or to otherwise access the authorized encroachment, if necessary, to inspect the project to determine compliance with this permit.

12. Legal responsibilities for damages. The Department, by issuing this individual permit, accepts no legal responsibility for any damage direct or indirect of whatever nature and by whoever suffered arising out of the approved project.
13. Rights and Privileges. This permit does not authorize any damage to private property or invasion of private rights or the violation of federal, state, or local laws or regulations. In addition, this permit does not convey any title or interest to the lands lying under public waters or waters affected.
14. Duty to comply and enforcement. The permittee shall comply with all terms and conditions of this permit. Any permit noncompliance shall constitute a violation of 29 V.S.A. Chapter 11 and may be cause for an enforcement action and revocation, modification, or suspension of this permit. It shall not be a defense for the permittee in an enforcement action that it would have been necessary to halt or reduce the permitted activity to maintain compliance with the conditions of this permit.
15. Reopener. If, after granting this permit, the Department determines that there is evidence indicating that an authorized activity does not comply with the requirements of 29 V.S.A. Chapter 11, the Department may reopen and modify this permit to include different limitations and requirements.
16. Revocation. This permit is subject to the conditions and specifications herein and may be suspended or revoked at any time for cause including: failure by the permittee to disclose all relevant facts during the application process which were known at that time; misrepresentation of any relevant fact at any time; non-compliance with the conditions and specifications of the permit; or a change in the factors associated with the encroachment's effect on the public trust or public good so that on balance the Department finds that the encroachment adversely affects the public trust or public good.
17. Severance. The provisions of this permit are severable, and if any provision of this permit, or the application of any provision of this permit to any circumstance, is held invalid, the application of such provision to other circumstances, and the remainder of this permit, shall not be affected thereby.
18. Appeals.
  - A. Renewable Energy Projects – Right to Appeal to Public Service Board. If this decision relates to a renewable energy plant for which a certificate of public good is required under 30 V.S.A. § 248, any appeal of this decision must be filed with the Vermont Public Service Board pursuant to 10 V.S.A. § 8506. This section does not apply to a facility that is subject to 10 V.S.A. § 1004 (dams before the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission), 10 V.S.A. § 1006 (certification of hydroelectric projects), or 10 V.S.A. Chapter 43 (dams). Any appeal under this section must be filed with the Clerk of the Public Service Board within 30 days of the date of this decision; the appellant must file with the Clerk an original and six copies of its appeal. The appellant shall provide notice of the filing of an appeal in accordance with 10 V.S.A. § 8504(c)(2), and shall also serve a copy of the Notice of Appeal on the Vermont Department of Public Service. For further information, see the Rules and General Orders of the Public Service Board, available online at [www.psb.vermont.gov](http://www.psb.vermont.gov). The address for the Public Service Board is: 112 State Street, Montpelier, Vermont, 05620-2701; Telephone #: 802-828-2358.
  - B. All Other Projects – Right to Appeal to Environmental Court. Pursuant to 10 V.S.A. Chapter 220, any appeal of this decision must be filed with the clerk of the Environmental Division of the Superior Court within 30 days of the date of the decision. The Notice of Appeal must specify the parties taking the appeal and the statutory provision under which each party claims party status;

must designate the act or decision appealed from; must name the Environmental Division; and must be signed by the appellant or the appellant's attorney. The appeal must give the address or location and description of the property, project, or facility with which the appeal is concerned and the name of the applicant or any permit involved in the appeal. The appellant must also serve a copy of the Notice of Appeal in accordance with Rule 5(b)(4)(B) of the Vermont Rules for Environmental Court Proceedings. For further information, see the Vermont Rules for Environmental Court Proceedings available at [www.vermontjudiciary.org](http://www.vermontjudiciary.org). The address for the Environmental Division is: 32 Cherry Street; 2nd Floor, Suite 303; Burlington, VT 05401 Telephone #: 802-951-1740.

**c. Findings**

1. Jurisdiction - 29 V.S.A. § 403: Lake Carmi in Franklin is a public water of the state of Vermont. The project encroaches beyond the shoreline as delineated by the mean water level. Therefore, the Department has jurisdiction under 29 V.S.A. Chapter 11.
2. Application Receipt and Review - 29 V.S.A. § 404: On July 12, 2016, the Department received an application from Mullen Lakeshore, Inc. (permittee), under the provisions of 29 V.S.A. Chapter 11, for authorization to remove existing failed gabion baskets and a timber crib retaining wall and replace it with riprap and vegetation to stabilize the shoreline located within the public waters of Lake Carmi, Franklin.
3. Public Notification - 29 V.S.A. § 405(a): The Department gave written notice of this application to the municipality in which the proposed encroachment is located, abutting property owners, and others having an interest in this matter and provided an opportunity for interested persons to file written comments or request a public information meeting. The notice period began on July 13, 2016 and closed at 4:30 PM on August 11, 2016 No comments were received. No request for a public information meeting was received.
4. Background; Lake Encroachment Permit History: NONE
5. Project Description: Stabilize the shoreline by removing existing failed gabion baskets and a timber crib wall and installing 47 square feet of up to 3' dimensional riprap at or beyond mean water level to a height not exceeding 15". The steep slope will be regraded on a 2:1 ratio landward. The regraded sloped area and the top of the bank will be revegetated with 35 square feet of low-growing shrubs or understory trees.
6. Project Purpose: Stabilize the shoreline by removing the existing failed gabion baskets and a timber crib wall and installing riprap at and below the mean water level, and revegetating the shoreline.
7. Effect of Encroachment – Whether Excessive for Stated Purpose: The project is not excessive for the stated purpose.
8. Effect of Encroachment – Less Intrusive Feasible Alternatives: This project represents a less intrusive feasible alternative in comparison with replacing the failing gabion basket wall with a similarly designed structural shoreline stabilization project.
9. Effect of Encroachment – Measures to Reduce Impacts on Public Resources: A silt screen fence will be installed in the water around the work area to contain turbidity. Heavy equipment will work from shore.
10. Placement of Fill: The project will result in additional fill placed no more than 1' beyond the mean water level consisting of 47 square feet of up to 3' dimensional riprap placed to a height not exceeding 15" at or

above mean water level. The adverse impacts of additional fill in the lake will be outweighed by the benefits of long term stabilization of the shoreline, especially removing failed gabion baskets, which are currently placed further into the lake than the proposed project.

- 11.** Effects on Water Quality - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): A silt screen fence will be installed in the water around the work area to contain turbidity to the immediate work area. Heavy equipment will work from shore. The project will not have a long term adverse impact on water quality.
- 12.** Effects on Fish and Wildlife Habitat - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): The additional riprap placed at and beyond mean water level used to stabilize the shoreline will be the minimum necessary to achieve the project purpose. The project will not involve excavation or dredging of the lake bed. The project will not involve work prior to July 1 of the calendar year to protect fish spawning habitat. The minimal adverse impacts to fish and wildlife habitat along the immediate shoreline will be outweighed by the benefits of long term stabilization of the shoreline.
- 13.** Effects on Aquatic and Shoreline Vegetation - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): The project does not propose the removal of aquatic vegetation. There will be no adverse impact to aquatic vegetation. The project proposes to revegetate the shoreline with 35 square feet of low-growing shrubs or understory trees. The revegetation plan will improve shoreline vegetation.
- 14.** Effects on Navigation and Other Recreational and Public Uses, Including Fishing and Swimming - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): The project is located near-shore in shallow water and effects to public uses will be temporary and limited to the project work area.
- 15.** Consistency with the Natural Surroundings - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): The project involves stabilization of the shoreline by removing failed gabion baskets and a timber retaining wall and replacing it with riprap at and beyond mean water level and revegetating the shoreline. The project will be consistent with the natural surroundings.
- 16.** Consistency with Municipal Shoreland Zoning Ordinances and Applicable State Plans - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): No adverse comments were received during the investigation from local and state officers and the project is therefore considered to be consistent with municipal shoreland zoning ordinances and applicable state plans.
- 17.** Cumulative Impact - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): The encroachment is the minimum necessary to stabilize the shoreline. The additional cumulative impact will be outweighed by the benefits of long-term stabilization of the shoreline and reestablishment of shoreline vegetation.
- 18.** Public Good Analysis Summary - 29 V.S.A. § 405(b): Based upon findings c. 11-17, the project will not adversely affect the public good.
- 19.** Public Trust Analysis: The public trust doctrine requires the Department to determine what public trust uses are at issue, to determine if the proposal serves a public purpose, to determine the cumulative effects of the proposal on the public trust uses, and to balance the beneficial and detrimental effects of the proposal. The public trust uses relevant to this proposal are fishing, boating/kayaking, swimming, navigation, and boating-related recreation. The impacts of the project on public trust uses include temporary impacts on navigation and recreational uses such as fishing and swimming, which will be limited to the near-shore project work area. The shoreline stabilization project provides public benefits in the form of long-term protection of the shoreline from erosion due to wave and ice action. The public

benefits outweigh the temporary negative impacts on public trust uses. The Department has therefore determined that the project is consistent with the public trust doctrine.

**d. Authorization**

Based upon the foregoing findings, and in consideration of the Department's Interim Procedures for the Issuance or Denial of Encroachment Permits, dated October 4, 1989, excluding Section 3, which was invalidated by Lamoille County Superior Court, Docket No. S96-91, 9/04/92, it is the decision of the Department that the project described herein, as set forth in the above findings and in the plans on file with the Department, complies with the criteria of 29 V.S.A. § 405, and is consistent with the public trust doctrine.

In accordance with 29 V.S.A. § 401 *et seq.*, the Department hereby issues this decision and permit to Mullen Lakeshore, Inc. for the above named project. The Department has approved the project subject to the conditions contained herein.

This permit shall not be effective until 10 days after the Department's notice of action and permit issuance in accordance with 29 V.S.A. § 405(c) and shall expire 5 years thereafter. If the permittee wishes to modify the encroachment or conduct other jurisdictional activities not authorized by this permit, the permittee must submit a new permit application.

Alyssa B. Schuren, Commissioner  
Department of Environmental Conservation

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
Perry Thomas, Program Manager  
Lakes & Ponds Management and Protection Program